Scott, Keith L.

From:	Scott, Keith L.
Sent:	Thursday, April 29, 2010 10:37 AM
To:	Nestor Peccia (nestor.peccia@esa.int)
Cc:	'chris.taylor@esa.int'; dstanton@keltik.co.uk
Subject:	CESG Review of SIS-DTN Green Book

Nestor,

Thank you very much for your review of the SIS-DTN Green Book. I am working to incorporate Chris' and Dai's changes, and Erik Barkley had a similar comment with respect to MAL. While I agree that BP should be able to carry MAL messages, I am reluctant to make it a requirement in the Green Book because the MAL specification doesn't actually say anything about PDUs. That is, at least the way I read the MAL specification, the closest it gets to specifying PDU formats is to list the logical contents of the MAL PDUs, whereas AMS and CCSDS actually give PDU formats that one can verify that BP can in fact transport.

I admit that this is a pretty abstract concern on my part. I can't think of any rational PDU mechanism MAL could use that would *not* be supportable using BP, but without a concrete format to support, it seems meaningless to claim to support one.

I think the possible ways forward would be:
1) If I'm wrong about MAL or if there's a PDU specification in another document, use that (I'd appreciate a pointer to such)
2) Add NOTEs proximate to the references to CFDP and AMS reiterating that BP is intended to be a general-purpose networking protocol capable of supporting any number of applications, including implementations of MAL.
3) Remove the references to CFDP and AMS and also not include MAL.
4) Simply add MAL where CFDP and AMS are referenced, acknowledging the above concern but ignoring it.
5) Other?

If I'm not wrong about MAL, would #2 or #3 be acceptable resolutions for you? If not, do you have a suggestion?

Best Regards,

      --keith

MOIMS AD	Nestor Peccia	Approve with Conditions	Excellent Document. Nevertheless I have the following comments: - ESA comments to be agreed (see SOIS AD comments) - The notion that AMS can be considered as an interoperable messaging protocol is not adequa (and this has been mentioned several times). The SM&C MAL has also to be considered.

1