|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| NL-001 |  | 1.3 |  | Te | “Along with the many advantages in terms of, for example, searchability and replication, the spread of digital technology in every field brings certain disadvantages. The rapid obsolescence of digital technologies creates considerable technical dangers particularly a much greater risk than in the past of losing the possibility of restoring, rendering or interpreting the information. Ways of avoiding or reducing these dangers will be detailed throughout this Recommended Practice.”  There are other risks and dangers that could be addressed here, apart from obsolescence of digital technologies.  The ease with which ‘fake news’, ‘false information’ can be created and spreaded. Not only by human agents but also bots e.d. |  |  |
| NL-002 |  | 1.6.2 |  | Te | “Archival Information Unit (AIU): An Archival Information Package where the Content Information does not include any other Archival Information Packages”  The Magenta Book mentions furthermore: “An AIU can consist of multiple digital objects (e.g.) multiple files.  Perhaps this sentence could be maintained, considering this has become more common. |  |  |
| DE-003 |  | 1.6.2 | Terminology | te | The term “preservation plans” should be listed in the terminology list. | Preservation Plan: Written plan for the fulfilment of one or more preservation objectives. |  |
| DE-004 |  | 1.6.2. | Terminology | te | The enhancement of the definition of the new concept of “Preservation Objective” seeks to emphasize the relevance of the concept regarding to long term preservation | From:  Preservation Objective: A specific achievable aim which can be carried out using the Information Object.  To:  Preservation Objective: A specific achievable aim which can be carried out using the Information Object. Preservation Objectives are intended to test whether the information actually is Independently Understandable by members of the Designated Community now and into the future. The enhancement of the definition of the new concept of “Preservation Objective” seeks to emphasize the relevance of the concept regarding to long term preservation |  |
| NL-005 |  | 1.6.2; 2.3; 3.2; 4.3 |  | Te | “To summarize, 1.6.2, 2.3, 3.2 and 4.3 are normative and form the basis of conformance to this Recommended Practice.”  What does this mean? Perhaps a few sentences could be added to explain what is expected. |  |  |
| NL-006 |  | 2 | Second paragraph | Te |  |  |  |
| NL-007 |  | 2.3.2 | Last paragraph | Te | “Various techniques for preserving the look and feel of information access are currently the subject of research and prototyping.”  “Though the OAIS reference model does not focus on these emerging techniques, ..”  It could be asked to what extent it can be stated that these kinds of techniques and this kind of research is still emerging. It seems that this has become more of a consolidated practice. | Leave out the words “currently” and “emerging”. |  |
| NL-008 |  | 2.3.3 |  | Ed | “An Information Package is a logical container composed of optional Information Object(s)”  A full stop seems to be missing here. | Add “.” |  |
| NL-009 |  | 2.3.3 | Figure 2-3 | Te | This figure could be adapted more to the amended definitions of Information Package and Content Information in section 1.6.2. It also does not illustrate the amended paragraph above and below the figure. “An Information Package is a logical container composed of optional Information Object(s).” “The Information Object is a Data Object plus associated Representation Information…” These two components are not shown here. | Adapt the figure in a way that it shows the components as they are described in the text that accompanies the figure. |  |
| NL-010 |  | 2.3.3 | Figure 2-3 | Ed | A space is missing in InformationPackage | Change InformationPackage to Information Package |  |
| DE-011 |  | 2.3.3 | Information Package Definition | ed | The paragraph consists of two sentences. A full stop is missing between the sentences. | From: “An Information Package is a logical container composed of optional Information Object(s) Associated with this Information Package is Packaging Information that describes how the components of an Information Package are logically or physically bound together and how to identify and extract the components.”  To: “An Information Package is a logical container composed of optional Information Object(s). Associated with this Information Package is Packaging Information that describes how the components of an Information Package are logically or physically bound together and how to identify and extract the components.” |  |
| DE-012 |  | 2.3.3 | Information Package Definition, Fig. 2-3 | ed | The figure should include the term “Information Object” as the revised definition of the “Information Package” relies on it. |  |  |
| DE-013 |  | 2.3.4 | Information Package Variants | ed | The paragraph consists of two sentences. These sentences should be separated by a full stop instead of a comma. | From: “The DIP(s) are derived from one or more AIPs, For dissemination purposes, the DIP’s Packaging Information will need to be created such that the Consumer can clearly identify and extract the information that was requested.”  To: “The DIP(s) are derived from one or more AIPs. For dissemination purposes, the DIP’s Packaging Information will need to be created such that the Consumer can clearly identify and extract the information that was requested.” |  |
| NL-014 |  | 2.3.4 | Last paragraph | Ed | “In response to a request, the OAIS provides one or more Dissemination Information Packages (DIPs) to a Consumer. The DIP9s) are derived from one or more AIPs,  The comma should probably be a full stop. | Change “,” to “.” |  |
| NL-015 |  | 2.6.4 | First paragraph | Te | The given examples seem to offer a somewhat one-sided picture if you think about a situation where an Archive system has connections to other systems and exchanges information via electronic messaging. Moreover it is also possible that consumers do not interact directly with the OAIS but via another information system that has a system-to-system connection to the OAIS. |  |  |
| DE-016 |  | 3.3.5 | Ensures information is indepen-dently under-standable | te | “Preservation Objectives” are an important concept for digital preservation, Our suggestion is, to add references to the concept in relevant places, e.g. in 3.3.5. ENSURES INFORMATION IS INDEPENDENTLY UNDERSTANDABLE | From:  The degree to which Content Information and its associated PDI conveys information to a Designated Community is, in general, quite subjective. Nevertheless, it is essential that an Archive make this determination in order to maximize information preservation.  To:  The degree to which Content Information and its associated PDI conveys information to a Designated Community is, in general, quite subjective. Nevertheless, it is essential that an Archive make this determination in order to maximize information preservation. Therefore the OAIS defines Preservation Objectives. |  |
| DE-017 |  | 3.3.6 | Follows established preservation policies and  Procedures | te | A policy establishes a normative frame. Archives need an empirical record about each single deletion. | From: “A deletion policy should gather information about the deletion (i.e., what, why, who).”  To: “An audit trail on deletions should gather information about each deletion (i.e., what, why, who).” |  |
| NL-018 |  | 4.2.3.3 |  | Te | “This includes information to support searching and retrieving AIPs ..”  In the previous edition the term ‘metadata’ was used instead of ‘information’. Has this been changed intentionally? |  |  |
| NL-019 |  | 4.2.3.6 |  | Te | “The Customer Service function will create, maintain and delete Consumer accounts. It will collect billing information from Access and will send bills and collect payment from Consumers for the utilization of Archive system resources.”  Perhaps the words “if applicable” could be added here. This in view of the development of Single Sign On policies and Identity Access Management where user accounts and authorizations are managed by another organizational unit than the OAIS Archive system. |  |  |
| NL-020 |  | 4.2.3.6 |  | Te | [The Establish Standards and Policies function function] “It will develop disaster recovery policies. It will also determine security policies for the comments of the Archive based, for example, upon statutory requirements and legal agreements.”  It could be acknowledged here that legislation has become more extensive and complex and new roles have been introduced. For example in the field of data protection and security. As a result an organization can have several units that co-determine OAIS standards and policies. |  |  |
| NL-021 |  | 4.2.3.7 | Last paragraph | Ed | “,for example to discuss usability, acceptable loss of information properties, and authenticity of the transformed Content Information within the framework ….”  Shouldn’t this be “Authenticity”? | Change authenticity to Authenticity |  |
| NL-022 |  | 4.3.2.4.3 | Table 4-1 | Ed | In the third, fourth and sixth column in the table a bullet point is missing. | Change “Information Property Description” to “– Information Property Description”, “Funding history” to “- Funding History” and “Pointers … holders)” to “- Pointers …holders)” |  |
| NL-023 |  | 4.3.3.2 |  | Ed | “The Information Package is also associated with zero or more Package Descriptions that describe the Information Object(s) to enable efficient access.”  Is this correct? Shouldn’t this be one or more Package Descriptions? |  |  |
| DE-024 |  | 4.3.3.2 | Information Package | te | Without a package description, the content information is not accessible for users. Since the archival endeavour aims at usage, the wording of the former version 2.0 should be used again. Even the archival handling of the SIPs requires a minimal package description to get the work done. | From “The Information Package is also  associated with zero or more Package Descriptions that describe the Information Object(s) to  enable efficient access.”  To: “The Information Package is also  associated with one or more Package Descriptions that describe the Information Object(s) to  enable efficient access.” |  |
| DE-025 |  | 4.3.3.7 | Unit Description | ed |  | From “An important type of Access Aid is the Finding Aid, which is an application Access Aid that assists the Consumer in locating information of interest.”  To “An important type of Access Aid is the Finding Aid, that assists the Consumer in locating information of interest.” |  |
| NL-026 |  | 4.3.4 |  | Ed | “Preservation process history information that tracks the migrations of AIPs, including media replacements and AIP transformations., whether…”  There’s a typo here. | Remove the “.” between “transformations , whether” |  |
| NL-027 |  | 4.3.4 |  | Te/Ed | “Examples of these statistics include the number of times an AIP was ordered over a time period and the average time between receiving an order request and shipping the requested holding”.  The average time between receiving an order request and shipping the requested holding offers a somewhat onesided picture. It makes you think of analogue material. Information retrieval via electronic messaging can be realtime. |  |  |
| DE-028 |  | 6.1 | General | ed | A formally established relationship will mostly be the better choice. It is not only a possibility. | From: “However, it is possible to formally establish the relationships.”  To: “However, it could be advantageous to formally establish the relationships.” |  |
| DE-029 |  | 6.2.4 | Federated Archives | ed | Proposition: include the case that local Archives already existed but must be brought under the new global system of Access AID.(+ missing blank). | From: “it would be optimal to build new local Archives based on the global schemas and Finding Aids to ensure high degrees ofinter-operability.”  To “it would be optimal to build new (or to reorganize existing) local Archives based on the global schemas and Finding Aids to ensure high degrees of inter-operability.” |  |
| DE-030 |  | 6.2.4 | Federated Archives | te | Using Unique Persistent Identifiers in an OAIS federation is to my knowledge the only viable way to operate for Federated Archives since AIPs should always stay unique within a specified namespace, which is the case within a Federation. | From: “Unique AIP Identifiers for each AIP in the Federation; it would be advantageous for these identifiers to be Unique Persistent Identifiers within some specified naming system.”  To: “Unique AIP Identifiers for each AIP in the Federation; these identifiers must be Unique Persistent Identifiers within some specified naming system.” |  |
| DE-031 |  | 6.2.7 | Archives with distributed functionality | te | The impression is that the example of a distributed development of the different functionalities provided by the Archives within an OAIS is completely missing in 6.2.7.  At least add this as a further example for Archives with distributed functionality. | From: “Such a distribution of functional areas or functional entities of an OAIS, as well as their composition into distributed OAIS, can be, for example, of a physical, organizational, or administrative nature. The motivation could be to distribute resources to achieve the complete set of functional entities or functional areas to establish a distributed OAIS in a complementary and collaborative way. Other motivation factors can be to mitigate risks or outsource parts of the OAIS in a way that enables the OAIS to remain an OAIS.  Archives could handle the distribution by itself. For example, an Archive could distribute its Archival Storage hardware in various geographic locations. In this example, such distribution would allow the Archive to maintain copies of its preserved data in ways that minimized the risk from natural disasters.”  To: “Such a distribution of functional areas or functional entities of an OAIS, as well as their composition into distributed OAIS, can be, for example, of a physical, organizational, or administrative nature. The motivation could be to distribute resources to achieve the complete set of functional entities or functional areas to establish a distributed OAIS in a complementary and collaborative way. Other motivation factors can be to mitigate risks or outsource parts of the OAIS in a way that enables the OAIS to remain an OAIS.  The specific type of distribution may appear in various ways. For example, it is possible that each of the different functionalities of an OAIS is developed by one of the cooperating Archives and then provided to all the other Archives within this OAIS for their use.  Archives could handle the distribution by itself. For example, an Archive could distribute its Archival Storage hardware in various geographic locations. In this example, such distribution would allow the Archive to maintain copies of its preserved data in ways that minimized the risk from natural disasters.” |  |
| \*\*-032 |  | Foreword |  | ed | For your information, an ISO Foreword for CCSDS adoption (fast-track) will be added by the ISO Editorial Manager after your next submission. | No action required. |  |
| ES-033 |  | Subclause 1.6 Definition and whole structure of the document |  | ed | Definition in the current standards and the revision current draft are not located in the Clause 3, where all the other ISO standards place definitions. This means definitions are not available in ISO Online Browsing Platform, a free and very useful tool for translators, standards developers and general public interested in terminology consistence.  Despite this, as some (not all) definitions are adopted in other ISO standards, these appears in the OBP without mention of the original source. It easy to check, for example if searching for OAIS (<https://www.iso.org/obp/ui#search> )  OAIS terminology tends to be difficult to understand and apply. An alignment with the terminology used in other related standards will be very interesting in the future. Having the definitions in the same place of other ISO standards, and consequently in the OBP, could be the first step in this improvement. | Change the structure of the document, including Terms and definition in Chpter 3. Rearrangement of other clauses and subclauses acordingly |  |
| ES-034 |  | **Title** |  | ed | OAIS is an international recognized model for digital preservation beyond the boundaries of Space Data Systems Practices. Following the examples of other ISO standards (i.e ISO 28000, which were developed in a specific field but are used in others), a more inclusive title could be very useful and more adapted to its current use. | Change the title, keeping only the second part and deleting the first one  ~~Space Data System Practices —~~ Reference model for an open archival information system (OAIS) |  |

ISO\_DIS 14721 (Ed 3)\_DIN.docx: Collation successful

ISO\_DIS 14721 (Ed 3)\_ISO.doc: Collation successful

ISO\_DIS 14721 (Ed 3)\_NEN.docx: Collation successful

ISO\_DIS 14721 (Ed 3)\_UNE.doc: Collation successful

Collation of files was successful. Number of collated files: 4

SELECTED (number of files): 4

PASSED TEST (number of files conformed to CCT table model): 4

FAILED TEST (number of files conformed to CCT table model): 0

CCT - Version 2020.1