CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-01**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 1-1 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 1.2

PID SHORT TITLE: Clarify Applicability

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

FROM:

This CCSDS URN Namespace Policy applies to all uses of the URN namespace made in any CCSDS documents. It shall be binding on the work of CCSDS as a whole.

TO:

This CCSDS URN Namespace Policy applies to all CCSDS documents using the URN namespace.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Current formulation is ambiguous and too wide.

What does it really mean “It shall be binding on the work of CCSDS as a whole”?

This PID requests a minimum change, but **CESG** should agree a clear unambiguous applicability scope.

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted.

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-02**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 3-1 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 3.2

PID SHORT TITLE: Keyword uniqueness

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

FROM:

The keyword is chosen by the requesting CCSDS working group. The keyword should not be already assigned at the same level of this sub-tree.

TO:

The keyword is chosen by the requesting CCSDS working group that is expected to check whether the keyword is already assigned at the same level of this sub-tree.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Make the requirement clearer for the WG to avoid bouncing requests.

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted with mods, for clarity:

TO:

The keyword is chosen by the requesting CCSDS working group. The WG is expected to check whether the keyword is already assigned at the same level of this sub-tree and to avoid such collisions.

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-03**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 4-1 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 4

PID SHORT TITLE: XML Expert Group

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

Reference:

This document defines a CCSDS XML Expert Group to review the requests. This group is composed of XML experts nominated by the CESG with no pre-determined terms. Etc. etc

Please add reference to CCSDS A02.1-Y (CCSDS ORGANIZATION AND PROCESSES) for a relevant procedure to nominate an Expert Group.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

If CESG can nominate an Experts Group there should be a relevant procedure in CCSDS A02.1-Y (CCSDS ORGANIZATION AND PROCESSES).

Will e.g. the procedure for WGs or SIGs be applicable? Or something else?

If there is no procedure, it shall be added.

------------------------------------------------------------------DISPOSITION: Reject. This definition of “Expert Group” is defined to be unique to the SANA and it has been in the SANA document since 2016. This is not a new construct. The XML Expert Group, as documented in Sec 4.2.3, on pg 4-2 of 313.1-Y-2, is just an instance of a Special Interest Group (SIG), as defined in the CCSDS Org & Proc, CCSDS A02.1-Y-4 in Sec 2 and 2.3.5, on pg 2-1 (and 2-19). Please see answer to CESG-P-2020-0-002, MM 3) for the rest of the A02.1-Y-4 references.

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-04**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 2-1 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 2.2

PID SHORT TITLE: Registration Authority

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

Reference:

The registration policy is that requests to add, edit, or delete entries in this registry will be reviewed by the CCSDS XML Expert Group, see below. The Registration Authority is the CCSDS Engineering Steering Group (CESG).

Amend, as needed, the text above to clarify the interaction of the XML Expert Group with the CCSDS Registration Authority etc.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Please clarify interactions. Is the XML Expert Group woken up by SANA?

How is the Registration Authority approving a request blessed by the XML Expert Group? Via CESG Poll or what?

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accept, with modifications.

Sec 2.2, pg 2-1, From:

The registration policy is that requests to add, edit, or delete entries in this registry will be reviewed by the CCSDS XML Expert Group, see below. The Registration Authority is the CCSDS Engineering Steering Group (CESG).

Sec 2.2, pg 2-1, To:

The registration policy is that requests to add, edit, or delete entries in this registry will be reviewed by the CCSDS XML Expert Group, see below. The Registration Authority is the SANA Steering Group (SSG).

As stated in the RMP, CCSDS 313.1-Y-1, Sec 3.4.5.4, pg 3-18:

**3.4.5.4** The SANA Operator shall use the XEG, as needed, to review requests for new URNs and to resolve any issues that arise.

To align with this change the URN registry header fields, <https://sanaregistry.org/r/urn>, From:

**Policy**: XML Expert Group Review

**Authority**: [CCSDS.SLS.SLP](http://cwe.ccsds.org/sls/default.aspx#_SLS-SLP)

To:

**Policy**: XML Expert Group Review

**Authority**: CCSDS.SSG

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-05**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 3-1 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 3.1

PID SHORT TITLE: Who requests a new URN for CCSDS Document

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

Please add in this section who shall request creation of a new URN for CCSDS Document.

Will be CCSDS Secretariat or somebody else?

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Section 3.2 states that CCSDS working groups are responsible for requesting a new URN for a CCSDS Schema, but section 3.1 states nothing like that (i.e. it does state who can request creation of a new URN for CCSDS Documents).

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted with mods:

Change: sec 3.1, pg 3-1, From:

All CCSDS numbered documents can be referenced through this URN.

Sec 3.1, pg 3-1, To:

All CCSDS numbered documents can be referenced through this URN. As specified in the Registry Management Policy, CCSDS 313.1-Y-2, sec 3.4.5.8: The CCSDS Secretariat SANA registry PoC shall request update of the document URN list when a new document is published, updated, or retired.

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-06**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 3-2 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 3.3

PID SHORT TITLE: Who requests a new URN for CCSDS Registries

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

Please add in this section who shall request creation of a new URN for CCSDS Registries.

Will be CCSDS Secretariat or somebody else?

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Section 3.2 states that CCSDS working groups are responsible for requesting a new URN for a CCSDS Schemas, but section 3.1 states nothing like that (i.e. it does state who can request creation of a new URN for CCSDS Registries).

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted. The text already says “The CCSDS protocol and related registries managed by SANA are identified under the ‘urn:ccsds:sana’ sub-tree as follows: “. Since it is clearly the SANA role to create these registries, and to manage the URN space, so it should be obvious that the SANA will do this. However, for clarity …

Sec 3.3, pg 3-2, change From:

The <registry\_name> corresponds to the SANA registry identifier.

Sec 3.3, pg 3-2, To:

The <registry\_name> corresponds to the SANA registry identifier. The SANA will update the URN registry when a new registry is created.

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-07**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 2-1 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 2.2

PID SHORT TITLE: Below where?

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

FROM:

The registration policy is that requests to add, edit, or delete entries in this registry will be reviewed by the CCSDS XML Expert Group, see below.

TO:

The registration policy is that requests to add, edit, or delete entries in this registry will be reviewed by the CCSDS XML Expert Group, see section 4.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

Technical Fact \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ **Editorial** \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Better pointing to an applicable section or document.

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted.

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-08**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 3-2 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 3.5

PID SHORT TITLE: Additional urn:ccsds sub-trees not defined

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

FROM:

Additional urn:ccsds sub-trees not defined in this document may be requested by sending an email to SANA (mailto:info@sanaregistry.org), specifying the keyword, the requestor affiliation (i.e., CCSDS working group or agency), and the purpose of the request.

TO:

CCSDS working groups or agencies may request additional urn:ccsds sub-trees not defined in this document by sending an email to SANA (mailto:info@sanaregistry.org), specifying the keyword, the requestor affiliation (i.e., CCSDS working group or agency), and the purpose of the request.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ **Recommended** \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Use active form also to make clear that only CCSDS working groups or agencies can request this. This formulation is recommended also for other similar sections.

Why excluding Areas? Why excluding CESG?

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted, with modification, to align with similar sec 3.2, pg 3-1 request from CESG-P-2020-02-004 EB 2).

TO:

CCSDS working groups or other entity that can create or modify registries may request additional urn:ccsds sub-trees not defined in this document by sending an email to SANA (mailto:info@sanaregistry.org), specifying the keyword, the requestor affiliation (i.e., CCSDS working group or agency), and the purpose of the request.

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-09**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: TBD PARAGRAPH NUMBER: TBD

PID SHORT TITLE: Definition of schema

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

Please define what is a CCSDS Schema.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ **Recommended** \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

The term Schema is quite general and may generate ambiguity. It is therefore important that in this document the reference is e.g. to XML Schema.

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted:

Change Sec 3.2, pg 3-1, From:

**3.2 CCSDS SCHEMAS**

The CCSDS Schemas are identified under the ‘urn:ccsds:schema’ sub-tree as follows: – urn:ccsds:schema:<keyword>

Sec 3.2, pg 3-1, To:

**3.2 CCSDS XML SCHEMAS**

The CCSDS XML Schemas are identified under the ‘urn:ccsds:schema’ sub-tree as follows: – urn:ccsds:schema:<keyword>

CESG POLL ITEM DISPOSITION (PID) INITIATION FORM

AREA PID NUMBER: **SLS-10**

SUBMITTING AREA: **Space Link services Area (SLS)**

------------------------------------------------------------------

REVIEWER'S NAME: Gian Paolo Calzolari

E-MAIL ADDRESS: Gian.Paolo.Calzolari@esa.int

------------------------------------------------------------------

DOCUMENT NUMBER: CCSDS 315.1-Y-0

DOCUMENT NAME: CCSDS URN Namespace Policy

DATE ISSUED: February 2020

PAGE NUMBER: 3-1 & 3-2 PARAGRAPH NUMBER: 3.2

PID SHORT TITLE: Who requests a new item for CCSDS Schemas

------------------------------------------------------------------

DESCRIPTION OF REQUESTED CHANGE: (Use From: "..." To "..." format)

Please state clearly who is allowed to request creation of a new item for CCSDS Schemas.

------------------------------------------------------------------

CATEGORY OF REQUESTED CHANGE:

**Technical Fact** \_\_\_ Recommended \_\_\_ Editorial \_\_\_

NOTES:

TECHNICAL FACT: Major technical change of sufficient magnitude as to render the Recommendation inaccurate and unacceptable if not corrected. (Supporting analysis/rationale is essential.)

RECOMMENDED: Change of a nature that would, if incorporated, produce a marked improvement in document quality and acceptance.

EDITORIAL: Typographical or other factual error needing correction. (This type of change will be made without feedback to submitter.)

------------------------------------------------------------------

SUPPORTING ANALYSIS:

Section 3.2 states that CCSDS working groups are allowed to request a new keyword for a CCSDS Schemas, but later on it appears that also agencies can request new items in the CCSDS Schema tree.

Make clear who is allowed to make requests.

------------------------------------------------------------------

DISPOSITION: Accepted, and already resolved. See responses for SLS-08 and CESG-P-2020-02-004 EB 2).